ISPA PWP TOOL
Regional Training Event

Barnabas Jachi, TASAF
bjachi@tasaf.org
on behalf of the ISPA PWP Working Group
PUBLIC WORKS AS PART OF SOCIAL PROTECTION
1. Country context
2. Why use ISPA tool
3. Tool application
4. Methodology
5. Key Results areas and questions used
6. Findings from the Assessment Matrix
7. Good Practices, Lessons Learned and Recommendations
CONTEXT
Tanzania
• Government adopted Social Protection as one of key strategy to address poverty.

• PSSN is being implemented to assist the poor and vulnerable households.

• The objective is to increase income security for poor and vulnerable households, while improving consumption.

• The program has reached 1.1 million households.

• HH receive a combination of transfers
Main components of PSSN

• Basic Transfers to increase consumption
• Conditional Cash Transfer to ensure co-responsibilities in health and education
• Public Works Program to increase income during lean season, create community assets and enhancement of beneficiaries’ skills
• Livelihood Enhancement activities to enhance income.
• Capacity-building to ensure adequate program implementation by actors at all levels.
REASONS FOR APPLICATION OF PWP TOOL
• The Government wanted to scale up PWP to reach more district.

• During a six month Joint Review, it was decided to make an assessment of implementation of PWP in the 8 district to:
  ✓ Contribute to the enhanced delivery and effectiveness of PSSN-PWP
  ✓ Strengthen Social Protection impact in the country by applying ISPA assessment.
  ✓ Assess the impact of Public Works and use the finding to improve the social protection systems.
Methodology
1. Consultation with Government to decide on overall field schedule.
2. Selection of sites and subprojects (type of SP, urban/rural, geography)
3. Selection of respondents
   - Direct/indirect participation in program implementation
   - Sector experts at National, Regional, District levels
- Local Service Providers at subproject level
- Community Management Committee members
- Beneficiaries: Women, Youth, Elderly, Persons with Disabilities, Disadvantaged Communities

4. Desk Review to pre-populate the questionnaires
5. Field visits (bilateral meetings, FGD and site validation.
6. Data analysis and validation using assessment matrix using a four colored scale:

- Latent: Significant attention is required
- Emerging: Dimension require vigilance
- Moderate: Moderately Satisfactory performance
- Advanced: Well performing practices.

7. Inception Report
8. Validation report to be presented to stakeholders for comments
Key Results area

A: Targeting and Eligibility
B: Nature of Benefits, Timing and Duration
C: Assets creation and Services:
   - Agriculture and Natural Resources
   - Road infrastructure and maintenance
   - Water and Sanitation Management
   - Social Services
   - Social Infrastructure
Key Results Area (cont....)

D: Institutions, Coordination and Financing
E: Monitoring and Evaluation
F: Coherence and Integration across programs
G: Skills and Employability
H: Conditions of Work and Labor Practices
.6 Findings

6.1 Targeting and Eligibility (Moderate)
• Targeting mechanisms and eligibility criteria are in place; 79% out of the target HHs. have been enrolled.
• Women participation rate in the program is more than 70%.

6.2 Nature of Benefits, Duration and Timing (Moderate)
• Program benefit is adequate, appropriate and compatible with local context.
• Complete information on the predictability and timeliness of program benefit is not adequate.
Findings cont..

• **6.3 Creation of Assets (Emerging - Moderate)**

• The program supported types of subprojects, identified by the community, that contribute to maximizing environmental benefits, and increasing resiliency on climate change.

• Quality of assets created is of concern, due to inadequate supervision of technical support and supervision from LSP; and transfer of ownership responsibility without clear link to annual plans and budgets of the Districts.
Findings

6. 4 Coordination, Institutions and Financing (Emerging - Moderate)

• Coordination/oversight mechanisms are in place. Actual links across programs not fully maximized. Pre-project capacity-building but can be improved to address quality assurance and sustainability of assets.

• Financial support to LGAs is available but needs to be revisited to address emerging operational gaps. Funding to cover all villages under the common targeting system can cover only 70% of villages at district level.
6. Findings

6.5 Monitoring and Evaluation (Emerging - Moderate)
• M&E plan is in place, supported with an enhanced MIS,
• Need to include quantitative and qualitative indicators on assets creation, skills training, cost-efficiency, economic and employability potentials; and baseline data collection should include outcome indicators of public works.
Findings cont...

6.6 Coherence, and Integration Across Programs (Emerging - Moderate)

- Policy framework for harmonization and integration is in place,
- operationalization hinges on existing common administrative tools.
- Potential for achieving coherence and integration across programs is high.
  Other complementary components are not fully operational.
- Integration efforts at local level is limited as demonstrated by the quality of assets.
- Multi-year plans are not linked to PAA investment and budget plans.
7. Findings

6.7 Skills and Employability (Emerging)

• Sensitization sessions and implementation strategy are shifted towards building assets through public works activities over establishing organized pathways for skills acquisition.
• Institutional and technical capacity for skills development is available in the country – this needs to be fully maximized by the program using training institutions available.
Findings

6.8 Conditions of Work and Labor Practices (Emerging-Moderate)

• Policy and legislative framework are in place
• Client Charter to govern beneficiaries rights and co-responsibilities in PSSN participation including PW, is under development
• Beneficiaries are provided with first-aid kits, safety training, and personal protective equipment (PPEs).
Complete assessment report available at:

Areas that ISPA tool did not cover

• Robust evaluations/research needed on
• Impact of PW on the beneficiaries
• Are PWPs value for money when compared to Cash Transfers?
• Quality of the assets in medium term
GOOD PRACTICES, LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS
7. Recommendations

7.1 Nature of Benefits, Timing and Duration
- Provide complete information on the predictability and timeliness of program benefit to beneficiaries, to give them flexibility to plan their resources.

7.2 Assets Creation
- Improve quality of assets
  - Selection: integrate into local development planning
  - Design: ensure adequate technical capacity
  - Construction: ensure adequate technical supervision and monitoring
  - Maintenance: VC and PAA are aware of their ownership responsibilities

- Create sustainable assets
  - Strengthen linkage with sectoral agencies and other programs through existing administrative tools
7. Recommendations

7.3 Institutions, Coordination and Financing
• Improve technical knowledge of local service providers on PW implementation through mentoring arrangement

7.4 Monitoring and Evaluation
• Include quantitative and qualitative indicators on asset creation, and skills training in the M&E plan
• Provide a metrics to measure impact of asset creation in terms of quality, income-generation/employability, and sustainability
• Baseline data collection should include outcome indicators of public works.

73.5 Coherence and Integration Across Programs
• Clear link of subprojects to food security, climate change adaptation, long-term economic and employability potentials, in annual and budget plans of districts
7. Recommendations

7.6 Skills and Employability

• Include VETA as member of the National Steering Committee
• Pursue collaborations with other like-minded organizations for synergy of impacts and benefits
• Develop flexible tailor-fit training courses, link to long-term economic and employability potentials

7.7 Conditions for Work and Labor Practices

• Enforce consistent standards across areas of coverage
• Enhance capacity of program implementers on standards
• Include a section on safety at work in PW Operation Manual
Some of the actions taken.

- Public Works has now been rolled out to 44 Districts (30%).
- Technical team in each district has been formed to provide technical support to LSP.
- Simple guidelines in Kiswahili has been developed to help LSP interpret sector norms and standards.
- About 2,600 LSP trained for six days on basic technical training.
• A set of standard drawings in A3 has been developed for use by district sector experts.

• The Public Works Technical Manual which was in English has been translated in Kiswahili for use by sector experts at district level.

• There has been an increasing demand from district in need of implementing Public Works, however resources have been a limiting factor.

• The Government has decided to roll out PWP to all PAAs during the next phase of PSSN due in 2019.
TANZANIA SOCIAL ACTION FUND (TASAF)

STANDARD DRAWINGS
FOR PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAM

JUNE 2017
Some types of subprojects after ISPA assessment
Stone check dam to control erosion
Semi-circular bunds
Maize cultivated upstream of a soil bunds
Micro catchments to catch rain water within the watershed
Earth fill dam after rehabilitating a breached section
Fish pond in which more than 6,000 fishes have been planted in the pond -
Thank you for your attention